WHAT STUDENTS NEED IN A TIME OF COVID

COMMUNITY AND TECHNICAL COLLEGES AS THE PATH TO EQUITY AND RECOVERY

WRITTEN AND DESIGNED BY CHALAY CHALERMKRAIVUTH AND JULIE CHINITZ WITH THE COMMUNITIES FOR OUR COLLEGES COALITION
Washington’s 34 community and technical colleges (CTCs) are pillars of local communities around the state. They are key to racial and social equity, educating students of color at higher rates than other institutions. Each year, more than 360,000 students attend one of these colleges, pursuing education that will allow them to go on to four-year universities or start their careers. Parents count on CTCs to educate their children and prepare young people for leadership in their communities.

In all, 58 percent of students in public higher education in Washington attend a CTC. Given widespread racial disparities in higher education, it is notable that 45 percent of CTC students are people of color.

The affordability of CTCs means they are often the best or only option for higher education. CTCs represent a crucial pathway to four year degrees and career preparation or progression for both young people and adults in transition — particularly for low-income people and people of color.

For years, state budgets have failed to provide CTCs with the funding needed to fully meet their mission and serve the students and communities they were created to benefit. While serving

2 Ibid.
3 Ibid.
almost 60 percent of the state’s higher education students, as of fiscal year 2019 Washington’s CTCs received less than 40 percent of state higher education funding.\(^4\)

CTCs now face potential budget cuts due to the economic turmoil of the coronavirus pandemic. In fact, the pandemic makes the need for affordable higher education all the more urgent. Washington State saw a record number of unemployment claims in May 2020,\(^5\) and the unemployment rate of workers without post-secondary certification was double that of workers with certification.\(^6\) People turn to CTCs for professional development and to obtain the training they need for higher-wage jobs. Washington State needs accessible post-secondary education to secure an equitable post-pandemic recovery.

The pandemic has also seen the precipitous growth of an already substantial racial wealth gap:
- In 2018, Washington State had the tenth widest income gap in the nation.\(^7\)
- In King County, more than half of Black residents experience asset poverty, followed by 45.5 percent of Latinx residents and 44.2 percent of Native residents, compared to 19 percent of white residents.\(^8\)

A full and just recovery from the pandemic must address this racial and economic inequality. As the racial wealth gap grows, higher education has increasingly become a prerequisite for quality employment. This pairing of trends heightens the urgency of making higher education available and accessible to all Washington residents. With 45 percent of their students being people of color, CTCs are ahead of other higher education institutions in the state in terms of addressing racial disparities in education.

During the Great Recession, austerity measures drove up tuition costs, rendering higher education less accessible and shutting out low-income families from workforce development and economic stability. Budget cuts also shuttered student services that are instrumental for program completion and student retention, such as advising, counseling, and multicultural programs. In this recession, we see a chance to learn from the mistakes of the past. Investment is the path to recovery, as well as the path to racial and economic justice.

\(^4\) https://wsac.wa.gov/roadmap/funding
\(^5\) https://esd.wa.gov/newsroom/initial-unemployment-insurance-claims-for-week-of-august-30-september-5-2020
\(^6\) https://www.bls.gov/news.release/empsit.nr0.htm
From my first day on campus at Shoreline Community College to today as its student body president, community college has always represented a means of breaking the generational chains of my socioeconomic status, and to give back to those who have sacrificed so much for me to be here.

What is happening with our budget and educational policies are decisions that personally affect me, that personally affect all of us as students, and that could very well be the difference between whether or not an education continues to be something that is accessible to me. They are the difference between whether or not I will go on to become the person I want to be.

SUNSHINE CHENG
Student at Shoreline Community College
Community colleges are the foundation of our education. They have been the foundation of our community’s education, our state’s education, and my own family’s education. My parents, grandparents, aunts, and cousins have all had the opportunities to pursue our education through a community college. In any stage of life, situation, or ability, community colleges have provided us with a way to take hold of our education. My dad began his education as a first-generation college student through a community college before he entered graduate school, my mom went back to school through a community college while still raising children, and I enrolled in a community college to enrich my education as a high school student. Community colleges have provided my family with the education and foundation for us to excel.
Community colleges are important to me and important in general because they allow for people at any walk of life to get an education while eliminating some barriers and minimizing others. Growing up, I felt like college was out of reach for me. Then, Running Start showed me that I was capable of completing college-level work. ...

While I was trying to figure out what I wanted to do [after graduating from high school and attempting four-year university], I was able to enroll in my local community college and take General Ed classes at a lower cost, saving me and my family some money when we needed more affordable education. Ultimately, community colleges are important because of the accessibility and the community they provide for people.
The affordability of CTCs attracts students, both young and mature, for whom student debt might otherwise outweigh the economic benefits of higher education. As of 2016-2017, estimated tuition and fees at a CTC were $3,852, compared to $10,081 at the University of Washington.9 Students testified to the profound personal and professional development that higher education afforded them.

Though students of color and white students express the same desire to attend college, “the gap between aspiration and college enrollment is especially true for students of color.”10 This gap is due not only to the cost

---

9 https://www.wsac.wa.gov/tuition-and-college-costs
of higher education but also to the exclusion of many students of color from the networks, support systems, and academic preparation needed for entering completing post-secondary education.11

This exclusion from networks and support systems persists for low-income students, students of color, and first-generation students who do succeed in entering higher education. In a 2019 survey of CTC students in South King County, 53 percent reported they were the first in their families to study for a degree beyond high school.12 Four-in-ten surveyed students found it difficult to understand degree options, career, paths, and course requirements.13 The disadvantage that many CTC students experience and the lack of adequate programs and services both contribute to an objectionably low degree completion rate of 43 percent.14

Even as CTCs are significantly more affordable than other institutions of higher education, 60 percent of respondents to the 2019 survey reported they do not know how they will pay for college.15 Focus group participants emphasized the cost of books. In a survey of 200 students spanning 33 states, US PIRG found that students spent an average of $1,200 on course materials in an academic year – up to

There are a lot of people here in Wenatchee who go to the community college because it is affordable. There are a lot of immigrant, first-generation students who generally don’t have that financial background to support themselves, and even then, attending Wenatchee Valley College has been a financial strain on them or their families.

- Lizbeth Rivera
Student at Wenatchee Valley College

As a nursing student, I think it’s really important to be able to attend a college that isn’t going to put you in major debt. I can’t attend a university right now because it would put me into a major financial debt that I could not get myself out of in ten years. … The cost of living is already high enough for the State of Washington. I’ve already gone through two years of college, but if I had to pay my entire tuition out of pocket, I’d be on the streets. If I didn’t have my family with me, I wouldn’t be able to afford to live anywhere because the tuition would be so high.

- Khaleah Thomas
Student at Highline Community College

13 Ibid.
15 Alliance for a Just Society, “Pillars of the Community.”
16 https://uspirg.org/reports/usp/fixing-broken-textbook-market
Community college students are the most hardworking students: students taking full-time classes at the same time working full-time jobs, or part-time jobs. Some are parents, they have babies, they have children. ... They work part-time or full-time on campus and they get money, or they get something to pay for their rent, to pay for their gas, to pay for their food when they don’t have any. And if that’s gonna be impacted—you know, we’re really making people choose between education or life.

- Evans Kaame
Alumnus of Clark College

39% of tuition and fees at community and technical colleges. These out-of-pocket expenses “can be a crushing expense that forces them to make hard choices about paying bills, putting food on the table, and taking enough courses to be on track for graduation,” according to their report.

As highly accessible institutions of higher education, CTCs close the opportunity gap for low-income people and people of color, offering students quality education, access to higher-wage jobs, a sense of community, and a chance to achieve their highest goals. Despite CTCs’ importance, however, they are funded below need and demand, leading to hidden and overt challenges for students: tuition costs that stretch the budgets of families experiencing asset poverty, out-of-pocket expenses, poor mental health, a lack of childcare, food security programs, counseling and advising, and housing and transportation assistance. Students are forced to deal with these challenges – products of racial and economic inequity – at institutions that are meant to alleviate that inequity.

18 https://wsac.wa.gov/roadmap/funding
ADDRESSING UNDERFUNDING OF COMMUNITY AND TECHNICAL COLLEGES

As of fiscal year 2019, CTCs received 38.1 percent of state higher education funding, despite educating a majority of students in the state’s public post-secondary institutions. Faculty and exempt employee salaries are 12.4 percent behind those of their peers in other similar states. 40 percent of classified staff earn 25 percent less than their peers.

Consistent with the trend across the country, CTC administrators are shifting away from tenure-track faculty and turning to part-time or adjunct faculty, offering low pay and little job security. As a result, adjunct faculty often must juggle teaching at multiple campuses. As of 2015, the use of part-time faculty in the CTCs ranged from a low of 48 percent to an alarming high of 78 percent. According to national experts, this development “threatens to undermine one of the most important predictors of student success: frequent and high-quality interactions between faculty and their students.”

Faculty of color are disproportionately affected by the shift to a part-time model: 73 percent of underrepresented faculty are in contingent positions. The casualization of faculty of color disadvantages not only faculty of color but also students, due to the positive impact of faculty diversity on student success. When asked what kind of support would help students like them enter and complete their studies in Washington’s CTCs, 41% of surveyed students reported that they wanted more professors of color. Students of color in particular benefit from the guidance

There’s already not enough support for students, especially in transitional schools. Those budget cuts just eliminate the people, the programs, the ability to support students in navigating academia or moving onto a university – which I think is the goal, for most community colleges. We can’t do that efficiently without support.

- Lizbeth Rivera
Student at Wenatchee Valley College

The relationship between teachers and students is symbiotic. When you’re constantly having to bring in new cycles of teachers, you never have a base of people who know the campus well enough and know the community well enough to really provide students the best experience. A lot of community colleges are not putting teachers on tenure track anymore. When something like a pandemic happens … instead of technically firing the teachers, they just don’t rehire the part-time teachers. And it’s these teachers that help students personally trying to achieve their dreams.

- Isaac Tchao
Student at Shoreline Community College

21 https://www.nea.org/assets/docs/HE/e-Kezar.pdf
22 https://www.aft.org/sites/default/files/facultydiversity0310.pdf
23 https://www.aacu.org/publications-research/periodicals/diversity-teaching-and-learning-affirming-students-empowered
24 Alliance for a Just Society, “Pillars of the Community.”
One of the bigger issues is that a lot of college students have mental health issues that they don't feel comfortable going to a therapist for. I am among those people. I have OCD and a lot of other issues. I suffer from depression, severe depression sometimes. And I find that talking to people that understand the situation, going into the campus and seeing that there are counselors there that are willing to help who understand because they have to help other students in the same situation is very helpful. But if they're cutting budgets for that, it's going to cause so many issues. **It's going to take away the people that most students trust.**

– Khaleah Thomas  
Student at Highline Community College

There are very few advisors for the population of Highline College, and it seems as though they're already stretched pretty thin. **If they were to possibly reduce advising budgets, I think that would be pretty catastrophic.** It would add stress to both the faculty and the students because advising is so important, and I definitely utilized that program as much as I could.

– Kimberly Basabe  
Alumnus of Highline Community College

Underfunding has also undermined essential student services, rendering them unable to fulfill their intended functions and adversely affecting student success and retention. This report will focus on four areas that suffer from inadequate funding: mental health counseling, academic and career advising, multicultural or diversity programs, and wraparound services.

The elimination of mental health counseling has proceeded despite the negative impact of mental health disorders on student success and retention – not to mention the quantifiable return on investment in student health services. Mental health is widely regarded as one of the most pressing concerns of higher education institutions: in a 2019 census of 750 chief student affairs officers, student mental health was ranked as the number one issue facing both private and public institutions of higher education. Students of color, first-generation students, low-income students, and LGBTQ students in particular “face unique mental health burdens and barriers to care.” But at one Washington State community college, 5 counselors serve a student body of 17,000.

Another significant predictor of student success, academic advising, also faces issues of budget cuts and understaffing. Seven advisors serve a student body of 17,000 at the same college previously mentioned. Considering the

---

31 Alliance for a Just Society, “Pillars of the Community.”
proportion of students who enter community college with limited resources for understanding higher education—four-in-ten students surveyed in 2019 reported they struggled to understand degree options and course requirements, and 53 percent are first-generation—robust and diverse advising services are essential.

Multicultural and diversity programs are often the first to see cuts when CTCs’ budgets decline. Yet they are crucial forms of support for the 45 percent of CTC students who are people of color, offering students the opportunity to engage in “community outreach, academic mentoring and support, leadership development, social and professional networking, and alumni outreach.” Such culturally sensitive programs contribute to the retention of underrepresented students, both directly, through retention programs, and holistically, through peer mentorship, culturally sensitive resources, and a sense of community within what may be a hostile or unfamiliar environment.

Finally, students cannot complete their programs without food, housing, transportation, and child care. However, 29 percent of surveyed CTC students reported difficulty paying for food;

The multicultural center on our campus is currently being led by this guy who has worked on the campus for I think over a decade. ... His attention, the sensitivity in creating comfortable or safe spaces for the students is immense. I mean, I’ve never seen someone who cares so much for people and puts in so much work and effort to try and help students in whatever ways possible. And the community that he built for these students—it’s really like a family. I mean, you have alumni, people already graduated. People who already have kids coming back to the multicultural center just to say hi and just to hang out with him. ... It really is that safe comfortable environment that he creates that really adds something different to a community college. ... If the multicultural centers were gone, that family, that personal connection wouldn’t exist anymore.

- Isaac Tchao
Student at Shoreline Community College

High income [students] don’t need to worry about outside money issues, such as rent, food, child care etc. There are also issues that come into play with mental health, such as stress and depression, that tend to get overlooked. Low-income people have to deal with a lot of mental health problems along with financial issues, creating an atmosphere that feels hopeless and pointless.

- Anonymous student

---

34 Alliance for a Just Society, “Pillars of the Community.”
26 percent say they struggle with housing; 14 percent reported difficulty getting to and from school; and 28 percent say they juggle caregiving for family and others in addition to school work. These are the pressures that prevent students from completing their courses of study — not a lack of motivation or grades. Community colleges are a crucial source of support for students who lack resources to meet basic needs.

As the state budget for CTCs has declined over the course of decades, they have grown less able to fulfill their mission of expanding student opportunity through training, professional networks, and support services. Students, staff, and faculty of color in particular have been affected by this decline in resources, which forces them to face racial and economic inequity within institutions that are meant to advance equity. Continual investment is needed to guarantee and bolster CTCs’ effectiveness and accessibility.

35 https://www.ccdaily.com/2019/05/wraparound-services-student-success/
Community and technical colleges are profoundly important to the students who attend them, as the testimonies gathered here reveal. The opportunities that they affordably provide drive racial and economic equity, and their impact on the lives of students of color and low-income students is apparent in these stories.

Constrained by underfunding, CTCs cannot fulfill their mission of providing affordable and quality education to students who want and need it. Just under 60 percent of the students who enter the CTC system do not stay long enough to complete their course of study. Given that CTCs educate people of color at disproportionately high rates, it is clear that students of color are not receiving the education they deserve.

The pandemic and recession have heightened the urgency of addressing racial and economic inequity. The tensions in our society over long-term racial disparities and the economic impacts of a deteriorated economy both call for significant investments in the CTC system.

Communities for Our Colleges recommends that the following policies be adopted by Washington lawmakers and by the CTC system. The recommendations are based on academic research and on
testimony from students about policies that will enable the colleges to improve the student success rate, especially for students of color.

The Legislature should invest in Community & Technical Colleges (CTCs) programs that provide equity and opportunity to students of color and low-income students by:

1. Making CTC campuses welcoming places for all students by providing for a system-wide equity initiative.
2. Overcoming the Digital Divide for CTC students.
3. Expanding resources available to students for food security, childcare, housing, medical care, and transportation.
4. Helping to reverse CTC non-completion rates by providing qualified and available counseling.
5. Providing the strongest and most stable faculty possible by addressing issues associated with overreliance on part-time faculty and by requiring pay equity.
6. Establishing policies and providing resources for improving faculty diversification.
7. Protecting and strengthening student aid programs.

1. Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Programs

Each community and technical college should be required to develop and implement a comprehensive diversity program for its campuses. Resources and guidance for these programs should be provided through the State Board for Community and Technical Colleges (SBCTC) and the Washington Student Achievement Council (WSAC).

The students in our coalition suggest that their ability to work with, support, and mentor each other adds to their chance for success, particularly for students of color. As a part of each CTC diversity program, resources, facilities, and assistance will be provided to permit students to develop associations on each campus for mutual assistance and support.

Because cost and cultural barriers deter many students from even applying for entrance to CTC programs, each community and technical college will be required to develop systematic outreach programs intended to inform students of color and low-income students with information and guidance regarding student aid and the educational opportunities available in the CTCs.
Communities for Our Colleges will also support the efforts of SBCTC to expand anti-racist curriculum reviews throughout the CTC system and to provide added staffing for its recently established Center for Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion.

2. Digital Divide

The current pandemic has caused the CTC system to shift quickly to online learning. Many students encounter problems because they do not have consistent access to the internet or computer equipment. During its transition to online learning, the state has provided many students with equipment to participate in classes, but not with ways to communicate effectively with counselors, faculty, and each other.

The Communities for Our Colleges coalition will request that these barriers to access be addressed as the Legislature and other state leaders work to overcome the digital divide.

3. Programs for Student Support

Many students report problems with food security, housing, health care, transportation, and childcare. These issues are often the reason why students are unable to complete their courses of study. The legislature has recently made an effort to provide assistance with food insecurity and childcare to CTC students. These efforts need to be funded and expanded to include added wrap-around services and stipends for healthcare, housing, and transportation. In particular, undocumented students, who do not have access to federal aid programs, must be guaranteed the fulfillment of basic needs.

4. Developing a Qualified and Available Counseling System

Testimony of students in our coalition points to a lack of counseling in the CTC system as a serious barrier to student success. The legislature gave recognition to this issue in 2019 by passing HB 1355, establishing a task force to establish staffing standards and ratios for the CTCs. The report of the task force is due in December of 2020.
The Communities for Our Colleges coalition endorses improvements in faculty counseling, which are critical to student success, and will support the acquisition of resources needed to implement the HB 1355 task force report.

5. Investing in a Stable Faculty Workforce

Academic studies and student testimony point to the heavy use of part-time faculty as a barrier to student retention and success. The major growth in the use of adjunct faculty that has developed since the 2008 recession needs to be reversed. The legislature should provide a requirement that full- and part-time ratios in the CTC system be returned to 2008 levels. The legislature should also direct SBCTC to conduct a study of faculty pay inequities and to provide a report to the Legislature recommending changes that will provide equal pay for equal work between full- and part-time faculty.

6. Faculty Diversification

Although nearly 50 percent of the students in CTCs are people of color, the faculty composition is overwhelmingly white. For CTCs to be welcoming places for students from diverse backgrounds, CTCs need to expand efforts to recruit and retain faculties that reflect their student populations.

While hiring freezes and budget cuts are likely to impede efforts to make faculties more diverse, the Communities for Our Colleges coalition recommends that the Legislature require the establishment of formal diversity in hiring programs at each community and technical college by December of 2022 based on the following standards:

• The State Board for Community and Technical Colleges will be tasked with providing guidelines for the development of these programs to be based on 17 Steps for Diversity and Equity in Hiring and Professional Development in the Hiring Process: Potential Barriers and Best Practices, developed by the Collective of Professionals from the Washington State Community & Technical Colleges.
• Students from diverse backgrounds and faculty bargaining representatives should be included as advisors in the hiring process.
• Each CTC should issue an annual assessment of progress on faculty diversity goals.
• Funding for administration, needs assessments, and recruitment efforts should be provided to each CTC.
The 2019 Session of the Legislature substantially expanded the state’s student aid programs and created an entitlement to tuition forgiveness based on income. These resources have been undermined by the current recession, just when they are needed the most. To protect and expand student aid the Legislature should repeal the limitations on the assessments on affiliated multi-national corporations contained in Section 74 of the Workforce Investment Act of 2019. This change will make approximately $50 million available each year to fund programs recommended in this report.

Additionally, testimony from students points to the cost of books, materials, and supplies as an economic barrier for many students beyond the cost of tuition. It is recommended that student aid programs be expanded to include aid for all expenses necessary to participate in CTC classes for eligible students.

For many undocumented students the requirement for three-year residency in the state before they can be eligible for aid is a serious impediment to their participation in programs aimed at helping them enroll in and complete CTC programs. This requirement should be changed to a one-year residency requirement.
We would like to thank the following organizations for contributing to this report: Alliance for a Just Society; American Federation of Teachers Washington, AFL-CIO; Centro Latino; Communities of Color Coalition (C3); Community for the Advancement of Family Education (CAFÉ); Equity in Education Coalition; Faith Action Network; Northwest Education Access; Washington Bus Education Fund.

We would also like to thank the students whose stories are featured in this report: Evans Kaame, Isaac Tchao, Josiah Joner, Khaleah Thomas, Kimberly Basabe, Lizbeth Rivera, Mya Leonhard, Reneeka Massey-Rones, Shewit Gele, and Sunshine Cheng.

We thank Lauren Lee and Melissa Wang for collecting the stories featured here, and we thank Alma Chacon, Carolyn Brotherton, Cinthia Illan-Vazquez, Dani Trimble, Evans Kaame, Isaac Tchao, Karen Strickland, Laura DiZazzo, Mya Leonhard, Reneeka Massey-Jones, and William Daley for creating the policy recommendations.